

1.0 Application Number – [WD/D/19/000634](#)

Site address - HOME FARM, WRAXALL LANE, CHILFROME, DORCHESTER, DT2 0HA

Proposal - Conversion of part of existing storage barn to living space & office/meeting/drawing rooms associated with the live-work use of the site; and erection of single storey glazed link structure between the dwelling and the barn conversion. External alterations to the dwelling and existing workshop (amended description)

Applicant name – Mr D Shaw

Case Officer – Christopher Lee

Ward Member(s) – Cllr A. Alford

Taking account of the comments made by the Parish Council and Ward Member, the Head of Service considers that under the provisions of Dorset Council's constitution this application should be determined by the Area Planning Committee.

2.0 Summary of Recommendation: Refuse

3.0 Reason for the recommendation:

- The application proposal would constitute the extension to a dwelling outside of a defined development boundary that would, by reason of its scale and footprint, result in an adverse impact on the character of the dwelling and that of the application site.

4.0 Table of key planning issues

Issue	Conclusion
Principle of development	<p>The application site lies outside of any Defined Development Boundary (DDB) and therefore the principle of the extension to an existing dwelling is only permitted should it be subordinate in scale and proportions to the original dwelling, and result in no harm to the character of the locality or its landscape setting. In this regard the proposals are considered not to respect the character of the host dwelling or locality and therefore are considered contrary to policy HOUS6 of the Local Plan.</p> <p>Policies SUS2 and SUS3 of the Local</p>

	<p>Plan seek to restrict development and re-use of buildings outside DDBs to proposals which do not adversely impact the countryside and those which serve specific uses and are restricted to extensions to existing buildings in line with their current lawful use. The adaption of rural buildings are permitted where the existing building is of permanent and substantial construction. The proposals are considered largely to serve the existing live-work nature of the site and as such are considered acceptable in principle in relation to policies SUS2 and SUS3.</p>
Scale, design, impact on character and appearance	<p>Policy ENV12 advises that alterations or extensions to buildings should be well related to and not overpower the original building. The proposed conversion of the barn building and additional glazed link structure are considered to result in an extension that fails to respect the attractive rustic character of the host dwelling, and that of the application site, by reason of its large scale and footprint. As such the proposals are considered to be contrary to ENV10 and ENV12 of the Local Plan.</p>
Impact on amenity	<p>The proposals are considered to be adequately separated from neighbouring residential properties and therefore there is considered to be no resulting adverse neighbouring amenity impact.</p>
Impact on landscape or heritage assets	<p>The dwelling itself is considered to be an unlisted heritage asset, and the proposed conversion of the barn building and additional glazed link structure are considered to result in an extension that fails to respect the character of the heritage asset by</p>

	reason of its dominant scale and footprint. As such the proposals are considered to be contrary to ENV4 of the Local Plan.
Surface Water Flooding	With regard to the comments from the Technical Services Officer the proposed development is not considered to intensify existing surface water flooding issues on the site. Existing surface water issues and potential remediation are not considered to be relevant to the application proposals.

5.0 Description of Site

5.1 Home Farm is a former agricultural site that benefits from planning permission (under references 1/D/08/001606 and WD/D/14/002027) for use as a contained live-work unit, understood to serve a business involving the renovation, storage, and distribution of furniture.

5.2 The existing dwelling on the site constitutes an ample two storey building that is central to the site along with an adjoining single storey barn structure that extends at a right angle along the Western boundary. The cottage is of stone wall construction with red brick quoins and slate roof, and is considered to be of a traditional, pleasing and simple design which contributes to its status as an undesignated heritage asset.

5.3 To the North of the cottage is a large modern agricultural style barn building which comprises external elements of timber cladding, concrete blockwork and corrugated metal. The building is split into two units of equal footprint and shows two dual pitched roofs. It is currently in use as a storage/showroom space.

5.4 To the East of the dwelling is another historic building of two storeys and of a similar stone and slate roof exterior to that of the dwelling. This building comprises offices, workshops and storage used in connection with the furniture business.

5.5 The application site lies towards the Western extent of the village of Chilfrome with its access West off of Wraxall Lane. From the road the side (East) elevation of the dwelling and the large barn are visible from the site entrance sitting back in the site with the office and workshop building adjacent to the site boundary being the most prominent within the street scene.

5.6 The site lies within the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty and outside of any Defined Development Boundary.

6.0 Description of Development

6.1 The application, in its amended form, proposes the demolition of the Western half of the existing modern barn and the conversion of the other half, along with the erection of a glazed link extension between the barn conversion and dwelling to form an extension to the existing dwelling. The converted barn would be of timber clad exterior with a weathered cement fibre sheet roof, and would house a kitchen/dining room, a WC, a boot room, a laundry room, office space, and a drawing/meeting room. This would result in a dwelling of 3 bedrooms, a sitting room, study, hall areas, kitchen/dining area, WC, boot room, office and store; along with a research/design room, and a drawing/meeting room which appear to support the commercial uses of the site.

6.2 Also proposed are various external alterations to the dwelling and workshop building in the South Eastern corner of the site that include:

- A change in roof ridge material to the existing converted barn section of the dwelling to comprise terra cotta ridge tiles in lieu of a steel ridge.
- Additional window and door openings to the existing converted barn section of the dwelling.
- Replacement of doors with windows and windows with doors on the West elevation of the workshop building.

6.3 It was originally proposed to demolish the entire barn structure and erect an extension of a similar scale, with a glazed link, albeit in closer proximity to the dwelling. The proposals have been amended to the current scheme.

7.0 Relevant Planning History

Application No.	Description	Decision	Date
WD/D/14/002027	Proposed workplace/home and alterations to an existing barn originally approved for storage purposes to enable it to be used as a display area	Approved	03 February 2015
1/D/08/001606	Change of use of existing buildings to storage and distribution of reclaimed timber	Approved	08 December 2008

	and stone flooring and other architectural items with ancillary workshop, display and office areas, Make external alterations to buildings. Form parking and turning area and raise height of bank		
--	--	--	--

8.0 List of Constraints

Dorset Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty : *(statutory protection in order to conserve and enhance the natural beauty of their landscapes - National Parks and Access to the Countryside Act of 1949 & Countryside and Rights of Way Act, 2000)*

Contaminated Sites Buffer Zone

Contaminated Sites

Surface Water Flooding

Veteran Trees 500 metre buffer zone

Landscape Character Area

SSSI Impact Risk Zone

9.0 Consultations

All consultee responses can be viewed in full on the website.

9.1 **Highway Authority** – No highway comment

9.2 **Technical Services** – No objection

9.3 **Environmental Health** – No comment

9.4 **Jurassic Coast Trust** – No comments received

9.5 **Frome Valley Parish Council** – No objection, comments regarding:

- Potential additional employment

- Potential traffic impact
- Improvement on visual amenity of the site
- Proposed construction is quite tall for a single storey building
- Suggestions of alternative external materials
- Surface water flooding and suggestion for remedial action

10.0 Representations

7 representation received regarding the proposals; of which 6 offering support with comments on the following -

- The proposals provide a sensitive route to bringing the site back into use
- The site is a key site within the village
- Objection to proposed first floor window on the South West end of the dwelling
- Assurance required regarding asbestos materials on the site
- Surface water flooding and suggestion for remedial action
- Enhancement to the village
- Concern regarding the siting of the conversion close the neighbouring boundary
- Suggestions of alternative external materials

A letter of representation received from Cllr Alford outside of the consultation period setting out:

- National Planning Policy Framework's (NPPF) presumption in favour of sustainable development.
- The application meets the economic, social, and environmental objectives set out in the NPPF.
- Shortfall in five year housing land supply meaning the Local Plan is effectively out of date.
- No reasons within the policies of the NPPF to justify refusal.
- Adverse impacts (if any) do not outweigh the benefits.
- If planning officers are minded to object, it will be requested that the application is referred to planning committee for determination.

11.0 Relevant Policies

Development Plan

- INT1. Presumption in favour of sustainable development
- ENV1. Landscape, seascape and sites of geological interest
- ENV4. Heritage assets
- ENV9. Pollution and contaminated land
- ENV10. The landscape and townscape setting
- ENV12. The design and positioning of buildings
- ENV16. Amenity
- SUS2. Distribution of development

- SUS3. Adaptation and re-use of buildings outside defined development boundaries
- ECON1. Provision of employment
- ECON3. Protection of other employment sites
- HOUS6. Other residential development outside defined development boundaries

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) 2019

As far as this application is concerned the following sections of the NPPF are considered to be relevant:

- 4. Decision-making
- 11. Making effective use of land
- 12. Achieving well designed places
- 15. Conserving and enhancing the natural environment
- 16. Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

Other material considerations

Dorset Landscape Character Area Appraisal
Dorset AONB Management Plan (2019-2024)
WDDC Design & Sustainable Development Planning Guidelines (2009)

12.0 Human rights (standard text)

Article 6 - Right to a fair trial.

Article 8 - Right to respect for private and family life and home.

The first protocol of Article 1 Protection of property

This Recommendation is based on adopted Development Plan policies, the application of which does not prejudice the Human Rights of the applicant or any third party.

13.0 Public Sector Equalities Duty (standard text)

As set out in the Equalities Act 2010, all public bodies, in discharging their functions must have “due regard” to this duty. There are 3 main aims:-

- Removing or minimising disadvantages suffered by people due to their protected characteristics
- Taking steps to meet the needs of people with certain protected characteristics where these are different from the needs of other people
- Encouraging people with certain protected characteristics to participate in public life or in other activities where participation is disproportionately low.

Whilst there is no absolute requirement to fully remove any disadvantage the Duty is to have “regard to” and remove OR minimise disadvantage and in considering the merits of this planning application the planning authority has taken into consideration the requirements of the PSED.

14.0 Financial benefits

The proposal may result in short term financial benefits for the region by way of employment of local tradesmen or use of local materials. Additionally, improvements to the site may bring benefits to the local economy with the provision of employment.

15.0 Climate Change Implications

15.1 The proposal would have to meet modern Building Regulations standards as regards construction and therefore would meet current environmental standards .

16.0 Planning Assessment

16.1 Principle of Development

16.1.1 Policy HOUS6 of the West Dorset and Weymouth & Portland Local Plan states that “*the extension of an existing lawful dwelling-house located outside the defined development boundaries will be permitted provided that the extension is subordinate in scale and proportions to the original dwelling, and does not harm the character of the locality or its landscape setting*”. The application proposes the conversion of an existing agricultural style storage barn and the erection of a glazed link structure to accommodate an extension to the existing dwelling that is of a significant footprint (approximately 287m² in relation to that of the host dwelling; 240m²), and height (approximately 5.5 metres in relation to that of the host dwelling; approximately 6.8 metres). In this regard, and in relation to the consideration below regarding the scale, design and impact on character and appearance, the proposed extension and conversion is considered not to be subordinate in scale and proportions to the original dwelling and therefore is deemed non-compliant with policy HOUS6 of the Local Plan.

16.1.2 The application site is unusual in relation to its live-work use, and policies SUS2 and SUS3 of the West Dorset and Weymouth & Portland Local Plan permits alterations/extensions to and re-use/adaptation of existing buildings outside Defined Development Boundaries provided that they are in line with an existing lawful use or for employment uses. In this regard the proposal to extend the dwelling within an existing live-work site is considered to be acceptable in principle in relation to policies SUS2 and SUS3, subject to consideration of material planning issues.

16.1.3 In relation to the comments from Cllr Alford the application does not propose new housing, and therefore the situation with the five year housing land supply is not considered to be applicable to the application. The potential environmental impacts of the proposed development on the built and historic

environment (as set out within the considerations below), are considered to outweigh any potential economic or social benefits.

16.2 Scale, design, impact on character and appearance

16.2.1 As discussed above the proposed conversion and glazed link would see a significant extension to the existing dwelling; resulting in an unduly large additional footprint. Policy ENV12 of the Local Plan states that “*extensions to existing buildings should be well related to, and not overpower, the original building or neighbouring properties, unless they achieve significant visual enhancement to both the building and surrounding area*”. The resulting development, whilst largely a conversion of an existing barn structure would be read as an extension to the dwelling, and is considered therefore to result in an overpowering and dominating impact on the host dwelling by virtue of its significant footprint and scale. The proposed link structure would be sizable in terms of its length and in connecting the barn to the dwelling would result in an awkward and elongated pattern of development within the site, particularly when viewed from the wider surroundings.

16.2.2 It is noted that the proposed external materials for the conversion and extension have been selected so as to maintain the rural aesthetic of the site, and that some general visual enhancement to the site as a whole may occur from the updating of materials; however this is considered to not to override the harm in relation to the character of the dwelling and the site.

16.2.3 The alterations proposed to the host dwelling and workshop building are considered to be minor alterations that would not result in any adverse impact in design and visual amenity terms.

16.3 Impact on amenity

16.3.1 The proposed development is considered to show adequate separation from neighbouring dwellings so as to result in no overbearing neighbouring amenity impact. The proposed conversion would take place within the existing constraints of the barn and would represent no additional height.

16.3.2 In relation to concerns over the proposed upper floor window in the Western elevation of the main house this window would serve a staircase and landing area and therefore there is not considered to be a significant neighbouring amenity impact in relation to overlooking into the neighbouring property Home Farm Cottages.

16.4 Impact on landscape or heritage assets

16.4.1 The building on the application site (now in use as a dwelling) has been in existence, as detailed on historic Ordinance Survey maps since at least the early 20th Century. The cottage is a visually pleasing stone structure with the appearance of a former working building, and as such, although unlisted, is considered to be a heritage asset. In this regard the proposed conversion and extension, by virtue of the impacts already discussed is considered neither to preserve nor enhance the setting

of the asset. Therefore the proposals are considered to be contrary to policy ENV4 of the Local Plan and section 16 of the National Planning Policy Framework.

16.5 Surface Water Flooding

16.5.1 With regard to the comments from the Technical Services Officer the proposed development is not considered to intensify existing surface water flooding issues on the site. Existing surface water issues and potential remediation are not considered to be relevant to the application proposals.

17.0 Conclusion

The proposed development fails to comply with national and local planning policy and is recommended for refusal.

18.0 RECOMMENDATION

Refuse for the following reasons:

18.1 The proposed barn conversion and extension to the host dwelling at Home Farm, by virtue of its significant increase in scale and footprint, is considered to represent a dominating and overpowering impact on the character of the dwelling and is considered to neither preserve nor enhance the setting of the dwelling as an unlisted heritage asset. The proposal would result in an awkward and elongated layout within the site that would result in an inharmonious feature visible in the wider context. As such the proposed development is considered to be contrary to policies ENV4, ENV10, ENV12 and HOUS6 of the West Dorset and Weymouth & Portland Local Plan, and paragraphs 193 to 196 of the National Planning Policy Framework.